Minutes of the Regular Meeting of the
Sanford Historic Preservation Commission
Buggy Building Conference Room
7:00 PM Monday, March 27, 2017
115 Chatham Street

Roll Call:
Commissioners Present: David Nestor, Philip Yarborough, Allen Gordon and Greg Stoch
Commissioners Absent: Jenks Youngblood, Tracy Hughes and Brian Mitchell
Staff Present: Liz Whitmore, Historic Preservation Planner II; Anne Sears, Secretary to the Commission; Al Benshoff, Commission Attorney

Government Official Present: Councilman Sam Gaskins
Witnesses and Guests: Ed Duffle, Melanie Underwood, Kim Hall, Robert Dossenbach & Steve Underwood

Chair Nestor called the meeting to order.

1. Staff Anne Sears called the roll and a quorum was determined.

2. Approval of the Agenda for March 27, 2017:
Chair Nestor called for approval of the agenda for March 27, 2017. Commissioner Gordon moved to approve the agenda; seconded by Commissioner Yarborough and the motion passed unanimously.

3. Approval of the February 20, 2017 Minutes:
Chair Nestor called for the approval of the minutes for February 20, 2017. Commissioner Stoch moved to approve the minutes for the February 20, 2017; seconded by Commissioner Gordon and the motion passed unanimously.

4. Public Comment:
Chair Nestor asked if there was any public comment. There was none.

5. Public Hearings:
At this time staff Whitmore, Melanie Underwood, Kim Hall, Robert Dossenbach were given the oath.

Conflict of Interest:
Chair Nestor asked if there was any financial conflict or conflict of interest among all three cases being heard tonight. (COA-17-08 - COA-17-09 and COA-17-06.) There were none.

Councilman Sam Gaskins arrives.
COA-17-08 – Application by Robert Dossenbach property owner of 200 S. Steele Street and applicant Kimberly Hall (business owner) who wishes to paint the brick exterior a soft green to compliment the Glider Pilot Mural (vinyl siding has been removed,) frame in the windows with wood and add wood shutters painted dark green.

In accordance with General Statutes the public hearing was advertised once a week for two successive calendars weeks prior to the meeting date and all public notifications have been fulfilled.

Staff Whitmore asked the Commission to look at page 3. The following criteria should guide rehabilitation: a. Maintenance and Repair. 1. The proper maintenance and repair of historic buildings and original elements is preferred over their removal, replacement, or reconstruction. Staff Whitmore noted that the vinyl siding was not original and has been removed. Staff asked the commission to look at (Exhibits A & B) on pages 9 and 10. Page 9 shows the building prior to the mural being painted. Page 10 shows the existing condition. When the siding was removed, black mastic remained on much of the brick façade. The applicant power-washed the wall. Staff Whitmore said they wish to paint the brick green that flows over from the wing of the Glider Pilot mural; see renderings on page 11 (Exhibit C) and page 12, (Exhibit D.) The main façade will be painted the Green Tea Leaves color shown on page 13 (Exhibit E.) The wood frame around the window and the wood shutters will be painted (Blackened Pine), a dark forest green.

Staff Whitmore stated the guidelines recommend that deteriorated historic features or non-historic features be removed with the gentlest means possible to protect the underlying or attached historic material. The vinyl siding was removed carefully, mortar stayed intact and none of the bricks pulled out with the vinyl siding, but it is very unsightly because of the black mastic that is now exposed. The applicant is proposing to paint the original brick page 13, (Green Tea Leaves, (Exhibit E.) The paint selection compliments the Glider Pilot mural. Replacement of awnings will be approved at staff level as (Minor Work.) Commissioner Stoch asked if they were only painting the one side facing Wicker, and painting the windows as well. Staff Whitmore relayed that they were painting all the façade; trimming out the windows and shutters will be added to the windows. Commissioner Stoch asked if chemicals could be used to remove the black mastic. Staff Whitmore relayed that it could cause damage to the brick. Staff Whitmore stated page 12, (Exhibit D) shows how the façade will appear after completion.

Commissioner Yarborough shared that the improvements would look better and congruous.

Chair Nestor asked if the applicant would like to say anything. Owner, Robert Dossenbach shared positive comments on how much better the exterior would look.

Chair Nestor closed the Public Hearing.
**Finding of Fact Motion:**
Commissioner Yarborough moved in regards to COA-17-08-200 S. Steele Street, that the Historic Preservation Commission find as fact that the framing of the windows and addition of the shutters painted Blackened Pine along with the painting of the façade (Green Tea Leaves), when completed, is in accordance with the Downtown Design Guidelines and the decision of Commission is congruous with the character of the Historic District as the proposed paint, framing of the windows, addition of shutters, and the proposed paint colors will complement the Silent Wings mural located on Wicker Street. It shall be noted vinyl siding was removed which left black mastic on the original brick façade, the afore referenced improvements will ensure that this project will be in general harmony with the criteria in the design guidelines, the special character of the neighboring properties, and the historic district as a whole; seconded by Commissioner Gordon and it passed unanimously.

**Final Motion:**
Commissioner Yarborough moved based on the preceding finding(s) of fact, that the Historic Preservation Commission grant a Certificate of Appropriateness to property owner Robert Dossenbach and applicant Kim Hall for the installation of wood framing and wood shutters around two windows painted Blackened Pine and the painting of the facade, (Green Tea Leaves) for COA-17-08, 200 S. Steele Street; seconded by Commissioner Gordon and it passed unanimously.

Robert Dossenbach and Kim Hall leave at this time.

COA-17-09-Application by Melanie Underwood property owner of 511 N. Gulf Street who wishes to remove the original siding and trim and replace with Hardi-Plank/Cement Board. The main facade will be painted a soft yellow and all trim will be white.

Staff Whitmore asked the Commission to look at the staff report, page 3, under Guidelines. The adopted guidelines state, (f) “The original siding should not be replaced or covered by artificial siding such as aluminum, vinyl, asphalt, asbestos, Masonite, or pressed board that would not have been used on the original structure.” The applicant is proposing to remove the original siding and replace with Hardi-Plank/Cement Board (Exhibit A.) Staff Whitmore referred to page 11 (Exhibit B & C.) Staff shared the applicant stated there is quite a bit of rotting when they removed the wood. They will install insulation. The proposal is to paint the house the same color. The profile of the Hardi-Plank and the existing siding is the same. Staff Whitmore noted that any rot around the window frames will be repaired and is deemed routine maintenance.

Staff Whitmore shared that the contractor Lawrence Curtis is not here tonight because he did not feel well.

Chair Nestor asked Staff how much of the Hardi-Plank they are exposing? She stated it was four inches, will complement the existing reveal of the plank siding that is already on the house.

Commissioner Stoch stated he was familiar with Hardi-Plank; how nice it is and the fact that it lasts a long time.
Commissioner Yarborough asked if this house had German Siding. Staff Whitmore stated it does not; it has a flat profile (lap siding).

Chair Nestor asked if there were any questions for the applicant.

Being no questions from the commission, Chair Nestor noted that it is very important that the reveal or the exposure on the new siding be similar to what is on there now. The historic look is the 4" or 5" reveal opposed to the 6" or 7" inch reveal.

Ms. Underwood relayed that she owns the house next door too.

Staff Whitmore stated that the building contractor, Lawrence Curtis knows the rules that apply to the historic district.

Chair Nestor closed the Public Hearing.

Finding of Fact:
Commissioner Gordon moved in regards to COA-17-09, 511 N. Gulf Street if the removal of the original siding and replacement of the original siding with Hardi-plank concrete boards are done in accordance with the decision by the Historic Preservation Commission, it is congruous with the character of the district, for the reason, that they plan to paint the house the same color, the Hardi-Plank profile is going to be similar or complement the existing siding and the profile should have a similar reveal and is therefore generally in harmony with the criteria in the design guidelines and the special character of the neighboring properties and the historic district as a whole; seconded by Commissioner Stoch and it passed unanimously.

Final Motion:
Commissioner Gordon moved based on the preceding finding(s) of fact, I move that the Historic Preservation Commission grant a Certificate of Appropriateness for the removal of the original siding and replacement of the original siding with Hardi-Plank concrete boards to Melanie Underwood and approve the proposal(s) as shown in COA-17-09, 511 N. Gulf Street; seconded by Commissioner Stoch and it passed unanimously.

Steve and Melanie Underwood leave at this time.

COA-17-06- Application by Mr. Alonzo and Mrs. Alice Keifer, property owners of 310 Summitt Drive who wish to remove 1 (one) large Black Cherry deemed in Fair condition in 2008 and one (1) Sweet Gum deemed Good condition in 2008, both trees are in the rear yard. Both trees are damaging appurtenant features that include a 3-foot-high brick wall and a concrete patio. The applicant intends to plant one (1) ornamental tree.

In accordance with General Statutes the public hearing was advertised once a week for two successive calendar weeks prior to the meeting date and all public notifications have been fulfilled.

Staff noted that applicants for COA-17-06, Mr. Alonzo and Mrs. Alice Keifer were unable to be here tonight due to health reasons.
Staff Whitmore asked the Commission to look at page 3 under Guidelines: (a) The Black Cherry is a nuisance tree and the berries are poisonous and pet owners should be aware that this tree should not be planted where berries are accessible to pets, the tree has been further compromised by Wisteria which is an invasive vine in this part of North Carolina. Staff Whitmore stated if you look at Exhibits, (A, B & D) on pages 9, 10, & 12, you will see, the Sweet gum has girdling roots and has suffered storm damage; (b) It is appropriate to preserve, protect and retain historic hardscape materials, such as brick or granite pavers.

Staff Whitmore stated both trees have compromised appurtenant features in the rear yard. The Black Cherry is causing the three-foot-tall brick retaining wall to crack and has become unstable. The Sweet gum has also compromised the integrity of the brick retaining wall and has caused significant cracking to the concrete patio adjacent to the tree. Both trees have compromised historic hardscape materials. Exhibits C, E & F, (Pages 11, 13 & 14.)

Page 4, (f) of the guidelines state, “It is appropriate that mature, healthy trees should remain intact and undisturbed on a site, unless they are causing the deterioration of a building, accessory buildings, appurtenant features or creating a safety hazard.” Exhibits (A, B, C, D, E & F) pages 9-14 indicate that sufficient damage has occurred to these trees. One tree is severely disfigured and the other tree is a nuisance tree and has been invaded with Wisteria. The matrix #14 states “Landscape-removal of mature or dead/diseased trees may be approved at staff level.” Staff noted that she consulted with her supervisor and it was determined that this application should be elevated to Major Work thus requiring a public hearing.

Commissioner Yarborough asked, if there has been anything said about repairing the wall; it seems to be in bad shape by looking at the picture? Staff Whitmore stated no; but if they choose to repair the wall, it could be approved as minor work; routine maintenance.

Chair Nestor asked staff Whitmore if this type of tree is usually planted in the historic district? She said typically they are not.

There were no other comments from the Commission. Chair Nestor asked staff Whitmore to include a street view of the property for reference for future COA’s.

Being none, the Public Hearing was closed by Chair Nestor.

**Finding of Fact:**
Commissioner Stoch moved in regards to COA-17-06-310 Summitt Drive, if the removal of the Black cherry and Sweet gum trees and the planting of the ornamental tree are done in accordance with the decision by the Historic Preservation Commission, this application is congruous with the character of the district, for the reasons following: that both of these trees have compromised appurtenant features in the rear yard, the Black Cherry is causing the three foot tall brick retaining wall to crack and it has become unstable, the Sweet Gum also has compromised the integrity of the brick retaining wall and has caused significant cracking to the concrete patio adjacent to the tree. Both trees have compromised the historic hardscape materials; therefore, the application is in general harmony with the criteria in the design guidelines and the special character of the neighboring properties and the historic district as a whole; seconded by Commissioner Yarbrough and it passed unanimously.
Final Motion:
Commissioner Stoch moved based on the preceding finding(s) of fact that the Historic Preservation Commission grant a Certificate of Appropriateness for the removal of one (1) Black Cherry and one (1) Sweet Gum tree and the installation of one (1) ornamental tree to Mr. Alonzo and Mrs. Alice Keifer and approve the proposal(s) as shown in COA-17-06, 310 Summitt Drive; seconded by Commissioner Yarborough and it passed unanimously.

6. Old Business:
   a. Rosemount McIver Parking survey conducted week of March 20, 2017. The following properties were found in violation:
      1. 201 N. Horner Blvd.
      2. 401 Horner Blvd.
      3. 202 Chisholm Street
      4. 303 N. Horner Blvd.
      These violations were handed over to Bill Morgan in Zoning for follow-up.
   b. COA-17-08, 200 S. Steele Street, please note the required certified letter to Robert Dossenbach was not mailed, Robert Dossenbach was contacted by city staff and he did receive the notification by regular mail, however the required certified letter was mailed to Robert Dossenbach Friday March 17, 2017.

7. New Business:
   a. Staff update:
      1. COA’s: Updates on approved COA’s provided.
   b. Chair Nestor concerns about 223 Wicker Street. Missing bricks and mortar appears at the bottom of the building on N. Horner Blvd. façade.

8. Announcements:
   a. Streetscape Celebration- April 22th.
   b. Arts and Vine, May 6th and 7th
   c. Arbor Day, May 5th @ B. T. Bullock School
   d. Block Party on April 29th
   e. Mayor’s Annual Breakfast, May 4th
   f. Race to Read 5 K Fun/Walk, May 13th

9. Call for Adjournment:
Chair Nestor called for adjournment. Commissioner Yarborough moved to adjourn; seconded by Commissioner Gordon and the motion passed unanimously. The meeting adjourned at 7:50 pm.
Adopted this 24th day of April 2017
Respectfully submitted:
Chair: David Nestor
Attest: Anne Sears
Secretary to the Commission: Anne Sears